Trauma, Resistance, Survival: Linda Hogan’s *Mean Spirit*

Munasir Kamal
Assistant Professor of English, University of Dhaka

**Abstract**

Violence is pervasive in Linda Hogan’s first novel, *Mean Sprit* (1990). The Native American characters in the novel are traumatized by historical processes of injustice imposed upon them, such as uprooting from land, relocation, religious and cultural conversion, separation of children from parents, murder, and so on. Nola, a representative indigenous character, develops negative coping strategies—eventually killing her white husband as a consequence of her generalized anxiety disorder and phobia of white people. Hogan’s second novel *Solar Storms* (1995) is considered significant for its representation of the journey from trauma to healing. Though the protagonist, Angel, is severely traumatized at the beginning of the novel, she experiences healing on returning to her indigenous community and participating with her people in a movement to protect their land and rivers. In this paper, I point to the connection between environmental injustice and trauma, and the reverse correlation of restoration of justice and healing. I further reveal that despite the widespread trauma depicted in *Mean Spirit*, it is in this novel that Hogan introduces her model of healing—a pattern replicated in her later work. This model comprises reconnecting with ancestors and ancestral practices, and participation in grassroots movements to ensure environmental justice.

Extreme environmental injustice and trauma are at the center of Linda Hogan’s first novel, *Mean Spirit* (1990)—a Pulitzer Prize finalist. This novel, set in Oklahoma in the early 1920s, focuses on the historical and cultural factors that, over centuries, have generated trauma among Native Americans. Among these factors are the destruction of the natural environment, assimilation, forced dislocation, and crimes amounting to ethnic cleansing in attempts to gain control over Native peoples’ land. Hogan is ambiguous about the specific nation to which the Native American characters in *Mean Spirit* belong. She speaks of the indigenous people who isolate themselves, physically and culturally, from the Euro-Americans as “Hill Indians” throughout her book. Again, she refers to the Native American inhabitants of the town of Watona as Osage. Among them, Belle Graycloud—an influential character in the novel—is the daughter of a Chickasaw woman torn from their “beautiful, rich woodlands” in Mississippi, “herded” by the United States army, and forced to march to Oklahoma during the Trail of Tears (81). The Chickasaw—along with other nations including the Cherokee, Choctaw, Creek, and Seminole—were violently uprooted at the time. In leaving the nation ambiguous, and refusing to make *Mean Spirit* the story of one particular nation, Hogan allows the novel to take up the trauma of Native Americans as a whole. Therefore, this story also represents their collective resistance and survival.

*Mean Spirit* opens with the murder of Belle’s foster daughter, Grace Blanket, a Native woman. Grace’s “barren, useless land” turns into “Baron Land” after the discovery of oil on her property,
making her one of the wealthiest inhabitants of the region and prey to those hungry for profit from the oil boom (8). Hogan informs us that not all the indigenous Watona residents had come to the area by choice. Belle’s mother had been forcefully removed from their original fertile lands in Mississippi and resettled in Oklahoma. However, finding oil on their property leads to brutal attempts to sever the indigenous peoples from their land once again, making them victims of repeated trauma. The Grayclouds in the novel begin to receive several threats to their life when they take in Nola Blanket, Grace’s daughter, who witnessed her mother’s murder and is heir to Grace’s oil-rich land. *Mean Spirit* is a deeply troubling novel packed with images of corruption and crime, violence and murder. With the drilling of oil on their land and the devastation it brings to their community, the members at a communal prayer session remark, “some of us have broken all apart, like the earth” (75). This sentiment is repeated by a number of indigenous characters throughout the novel. The book begins with Grace’s murder and ends with Moses Graycloud’s killing of Tate after Tate murders his wife—Moses’s twin sister Ruth. In between are the unnatural deaths of a number of significant characters, and attempts on the lives of others. In the absence of an organized environmental justice movement in the period of the novel’s setting, *Mean Spirit* portrays trauma that is almost constant and all encompassing. However, there are brief interludes of respite as the Native people ultimately gather strength with more and more characters converting to indigenity, and in moments of solidarity between the town and Hill Indians.

The movement to secure environmental justice for all peoples officially began in the 1980s. *Mean Spirit* is set approximately six decades prior to the launching of the environmental justice movement—at a time when efforts to attain a safe living, working, and school environment for dominated populations could be no more than sporadic. In the absence of an organized environmental justice movement in the 1920s, a movement that has recently helped oppressed populations in North America to establish their right to a safe and healthy environment, *Mean Spirit* represents almost continuous trauma, spanning from Belle’s mother’s generation to Nola’s child’s generation. The Native town dwellers in the novel are survivors from uprooted communities who struggle to hold on to the land on which they have been resettled. They constantly suffer from insecurity since they are in danger even in their own homes. Sara, Grace’s sister and safekeeper of her property after her death, is killed in a fire maliciously set to her home. Her husband in the Christian tradition, Benoit—framed for Sara’s murder—then dies mysteriously in prison. In their absence, Nola becomes the target of the threats to take over Grace’s property. The only moments of relief in the novel are when the Native Watona inhabitants seek refuge with their traditional counterparts in the hills, and when these characters take up environmental justice causes—their right to make their own choices regarding their land and culture, and to protect their human and nonhuman relations. Examples of this are when Moses protests a new law allowing full-blood indigenous Americans to be paid less because of their perceived incompetence, by demanding to know, “Who made this regulation?” (61); or when Belle tries to remove the bodies of the sacred eagles—resembling “a tribe of small, gone people”—from the white hunters’ truck (110); or when the Hill Indians and the town Indians unite to prevent the annihilation of the bats at Sorrow Cave. These moments, though infrequent and short-lived, provide a vision of hope in otherwise extremely bleak and traumatic circumstances.
Hogan exhibits her awareness of historical/cultural trauma in *Mean Spirit* by linking her main characters to historical processes that have been known to cause widespread trauma in Native Americans. Among these, she focuses on forced displacement and the system of assimilation through boarding schools. Scholars studying trauma in indigenous Americans (Eduardo Duran, Bonnie Duran and team; Nadine Tafoya and Ann Del Vecchio; Shelly A. Wiechelt and Jan Gryczynski) have identified dislocation in multiple phases since colonization as a primary source of trauma. Among these incidents of displacement, the Trail of Tears—a trope throughout much of Hogan’s work as well as in *Mean Spirit*—seems to hold a particularly painful position in Native American collective memory. The Trail of Tears was among a number of forced Westward marches between 1831 and 1838 that Native Americans of various nations had to endure following the Indian Removal Act of 1830. Wiechelt and Gryczynski point out that though the United States policy governing the Act was “one of relocation, in actual practice the result was too often annihilation,” since those who refused to leave their homes were routinely massacred (200). In *Dwellings* (1995), published not long after *Mean Spirit*, Hogan alludes to the Hmong men, who “forced to leave their country and rootless in America, die of no apparent cause while they are sleeping” (89). Here she highlights the deep connection between Native peoples and their land. So strong was this attachment that separation from their land alone was enough to cause death. However, Hogan—as a member of the Chickasaw nation—is also acutely aware of the deliberate extermination that accompanied the dislocation which Wiechelt and Gryczynski describe.

Hogan locates the more recent suffering of Native Americans within the context of the trauma they have historically endured and accumulated. She portrays Belle and her daughter Leticia (Lettie) as remembering their peoples’ forced march along the Trail of Tears particularly at times of danger and/or sorrow. After Benoit’s apparent suicide (unmistakably murder since he is the guardian of Grace’s property after Sara’s death), Lettie—Belle’s daughter, and Benoit’s wife in the Native tradition—thinks of her grandmother who, along with their people, was driven out of her home and forced to march a great distance to Oklahoma. The people had felt “beaten and lost” (210). Parted from the land that was interwoven with their lives, they were devastated and could only wonder how they would “preserve their wounded race, their broken tribe” (210). Lettie compares her hands with her grandmother’s, indicating their common suffering. Yet Hogan chooses this inopportune moment to present a message of hope—if it can indeed be called hope. She notes that whenever a woman would fall to the ground grieving for a child killed by the soldiers, her fellow marchers would pick her up and say, “We have to continue. Step on. Walk farther along with us, sister” (210). Despite the numerous attempts to eradicate her people, this resilience—according to Hogan—is what accounts for Native American survival today.

The Indian Removal Act of 1830 contradicts the ideals of environmental justice in every conceivable way, and hence it was the root cause of massive trauma among Native Americans. This Act mandated actions that were quite the reverse of the “respect and justice for all peoples” in public policy that environmental justice demands (Principle two). The very act of colonization, and later, the hegemonic and oppressive practices of successive governments
denied “the fundamental right to political, economic, cultural and environmental self-determination of all peoples” that environmental justice so strongly upholds (Principle five). Moreover, environmental justice is firmly against the “military occupation, repression and exploitation of lands, peoples and cultures, and other life forms” which we see recurring in *Mean Spirit* (Principle fifteen). Sadly, an effective movement against such injustices was absent in the period depicted in the novel. As a result, trauma is pervasive in *Mean Spirit*. It is through the Native peoples’ eventual organizing around environmental justice issues and their resistance, the early forms of which we see in this novel, that the United States government was finally compelled to grant indigenous citizens certain rights which are reflected in the Principles of Environmental Justice.

Wiechelt and Gryczynski, in their article on trauma among Native Americans, further mention that while those who refused to move from their homes after the Indian Removal Act underwent physical annihilation, those who were relocated in reservations by the United States government faced cultural annihilation in the form of forced assimilation practices (200). One of the main techniques used to assimilate indigenous peoples with the dominant culture was to indoctrinate their children in boarding schools far from their homes. Children as young as five years were forcibly transported to boarding schools, and their parents had no say in the matter (Tafoya and Vecchio 60). In *Mean Spirit*, Belle recalls the law stating that if families refused to send their children to the boarding schools, “the children would be made wards of the state and removed permanently from their homes” (35). Once at school, parents hardly saw their children anymore. Tafoya and Vecchio observe that these schools were often located so far from the children’s homes that their parents, struggling with poverty, were rarely able to visit them (60). Hogan expresses concern about the impact of the American education system on Native children in multiple novels. Dora-Rouge, the protagonist’s great-great grandmother in *Solar Storms* (1995), as a child, tries to escape from the white people who come to take her away to school. Since *Power* (1998) is set in recent times, the protagonist of the novel, Omishto, attends a modern school. Outside school, she is guided by her Native mentor, Ama, but finds herself critical of Ama after returning from school. Schools in the United States, Hogan fears, functioned and continue to function on the assumption that Euro-American culture is superior to indigenous culture. Both Wiechelt and Gryczynski, and Hogan in *Mean Spirit*, allude to Richard Pratt’s infamous slogan, “Kill the Indian, and save the man.” Pratt founded the Carlisle Industrial Indian School in 1879, on which many boarding schools for Native American children were modeled. Tafoya and Vecchio relate that these institutions would isolate children from their family and community by destroying their knowledge of indigenous language, customs, and beliefs. They identify the process through which this was achieved:

- English language immersion with punishment for speaking tribal languages.
- Destruction of traditional garments and replacement with alien, Western clothing.
- Braids and traditional hairstyles shaved and replaced with Western-style haircuts.
- Buildings, dormitories, campuses, and furnishings of Western design.
- Forced physical labor in the kitchens, stables, gardens, and shops, necessary to run the schools.
- Corporal punishment for the infraction of rules or for not following the work and school schedules.
• Immersion in a Western educational curriculum with associated alien goals and philosophy.
• Regimented, time-bound schedules. (Tafoya and Vecchio 60-61)

Moreover, the authors observe that boarding school authorities were ill-equipped, or lacked the willingness, to deal with the children in a culturally sensitive manner. The children were, more often than not, brutally punished. We learn of Calvin Severance, a minor character in Mean Spirit, who loses his thumbs at the Carlisle Indian School founded by Pratt. The scholars on historical and cultural trauma also allude to the sexual abuse that Native children often faced at boarding schools. Tafoya and Vecchio suggest that remaining in such environments, devoid of affection or family connection for prolonged periods and through generations, has caused Native Americans to adopt negative coping strategies, such as alcoholism, drug abuse, and even suicide in attempts to deal with trauma (61). Hogan’s characters, however, are able to resist the influence of Euro-American schooling to an extent. In Solar Storms, Dora-Rouge is represented as a matriarch educating later generations in a indigenous worldview. Hogan does not specify how she bypassed the Euro-American indoctrination that traumatized so many children of her generation. In Power, Omishto eventually learns to use her lessons from school in combination with the Native knowledge acquired from Ama in a helpful manner. Mean Spirit is the novel in which Hogan most explicitly articulates her anxiety regarding the cultural trauma caused by the Euro-American education system. Though Nola is able to resist many of the culturally repressive regulations that her boarding school imposes on her, the author shows that these regulations have a definite psychological impact.

Nola serves as a classic example of an individual suffering from complex PTSD. Wiechelt and Gryczynski allude to J.L. Herman’s definition of complex PTSD in their study of historical and cultural trauma among Native Americans. They regard complex PTSD as the “alterations in affect regulation, consciousness, self-perception, perception of the perpetrator, relations with others, and systems of meaning” that victims of prolonged and repeated trauma experience (193). Nola, as a witness to her mother’s murder and an inhabitant of an environment where danger is constant, has symptoms that are not fully commensurate with the symptom-clusters of PTSD: re-experiencing, avoidance/numbing, and arousal (Wiechelt and Gryczynski 193). After her mother’s murder, Nola sleeps “with her eyes wide open, not letting her guard down” despite the Native “watchers” stationed outside the Graycloud residence, and the Graycloud women taking turns beside her bed “like silent sentries” (44). In spite of her open eyes, she still has nightmares. She also becomes speechless and has frequent fainting spells. Months pass before Nola is able to speak again, and when she does, she is given to constant bickering in contrast to her previous sweet disposition. Moreover, Nola undergoes a drastic transformation in her perception of non-Native people. Not all of Nola’s symptoms can be explained by PTSD alone. Robert W. Robin and his co-authors cite B.L. Green in marking that for victims of severe and long-term trauma, PTSD rarely occurs in isolation, but is “most often comorbid with substance abuse, major depression, phobia, and generalized anxiety disorder” (243). According to a theory of historical trauma, the white world held negative connotations for Nola, even before her mother’s death, by dint of her membership in an indigenous
community. Yet, Nola had been raised in Watona—a town with both Native and non-Native inhabitants—and as a child at least, the white world had not seemed to pose immediate danger to her. However, traumatized by her mother and her aunt Sara’s unnatural deaths (followed by her uncle Benoit’s imprisonment and “suicide”), and culturally assaulted by the authorities at her boarding school, Nola starts to generalize the threat posed by the white world. She develops a phobia of non-Native people, which is not reduced by her marriage to a white man who loves her or, at least, is enamored with her “exotic” appearance—“There was something wild about her. He thought he could love her” (134).

Hogan indicates that Nola’s trauma exacerbates when, against Belle’s wishes, she is removed from the Graycloud residence to a boarding school for Native children. In its broader definition in the environmental justice movement, environment connotes “the places in which we live, work, play, and worship;” this includes the school environment (Adamson, Evans, and Stein 4). The Principles of Environmental Justice call for public policy to be “based on mutual respect and justice for all peoples, free from any form of discrimination or bias” (Principle two). However, the boarding schools depicted in Hogan’s novels were established to undermine the pupils’ cultures of origin, and to replace their Native cultures with a foreign culture. Wiechelt and Gryczynski refer to M.W. deVries’s recommendations on cultural healing, which can be applied to Nola’s condition. deVries proposes utilizing still existing “cultural structures to help victims manage horror” after a traumatic event, and restoring “traditional social relationships” to promote healing (204). While staying with the Grayclouds, with whom she shared a common culture, would have helped Nola to regain psychological stability after her mother’s violent death, she is taken to an alien environment that tries to divest her of her culture. Therefore, instead of subsiding, with time, Nola’s trauma intensifies. Her terror of the white killers of her mother, and her revulsion against the white authorities of her school is extended to her white “guardian,” later father-in-law, and to her husband—not realizing that they do not pose identical danger to her.

The traumatic experience at boarding school is a key factor behind Nola’s gradual loss of sanity and its tragic consequences, even though she is able to withstand some of the school’s oppressive policies. On her first day at school, Nola is given a European-style uniform to wear, but she enters the classroom dressed in “an Osage skirt with ribbons and a pair of moccasins” (128). When the teacher orders her to go to the dormitory and take off the clothes, Nola returns to the classroom wearing only her slip. However, while Hogan highlights such acts of resistance against the school’s authority, Duran et al. observe that boarding schools were “operated like prison camps, with Indian children being starved, chained, and beaten” (344). Moreover, the living accommodations were overcrowded and the schools neglected the health needs of its pupils, often resulting in sickness and even deaths. Thus, despite her open defiance of the school’s regulations, the impositions of the institution must have aggravated Nola’s suffering and depression, eventually causing her to break down.

While in her psychological condition, Nola required sympathy and security, the school authorities express further indifference to her precarious state as the heir to Grace’s property by delivering her to Forrest, her court-appointed guardian. Nola distrusts her “guardian,” who
is also Benoit’s defense lawyer, from their first meeting. As Nola’s guardian, he is in a position to benefit if Benoit is found guilty of Sara’s murder. When her guardians in the Native tradition—the watchers from the hills—intercept Forrest’s car, she speaks to them in her own language. She tells them that Forrest and his son, Will, are “lightening crooked” and would probably steal her land, but they would not harm her “until after they’d had a chance to swindle her” (133). Later, Nola marries Will in hopes of sparing the Grayclouds from the threats that may ensue if she rejects his proposal. She is thirteen years old at the time of the marriage. Nola seems to love Will, but she is also aware of white men marrying Native women “to possess their wife’s and children’s allotments of land,” and that her husband will inherit her land in the event of her death (165). Moreover, Will makes a profit from collecting and selling Native artifacts—artifacts stolen from graves similar to Grace’s, which is robbed in the novel. Nola soon conceives, and her depression worsens with her pregnancy. As her pregnancy advances, she constantly speaks to her unborn child—“Look at this world. Look out from my eyes. You see the way the very sky is on fire?” (292). She feels sad for her child who will be born into a cruel and callous world—“Oh, poor child, you don’t even know if you can trust your own daddy,” she laments (293). Then one day, without particular provocation, Nola shoots and kills Will. On the night before the killing, she wraps her Osage skirt around her large belly and puts on her moccasins. Her identification with her own community at the time of the killing suggests that, in Nola’s traumatized mind, Will had represented not her loving husband, but the white men whom she saw exploiting her people.

After Will’s death, Nola’s genuine guardians—the watchers—swiftly transfer her out of Watona to their hideout in the hills. In the hills with her own people, if anywhere, Nola has a chance at survival and healing. The hills represent security and refuge not only for Nola, but also for the Native American inhabitants at Watona struggling to hold on to their land and traditions. The Hill Indians, we learn, had removed themselves from “civilization” in the 1860s, sixty years prior to the opening of the novel. Leaving Watona, they had succeeded in returning to “a simpler way of life” (5). They had learned “the secrets of invisibility” essential to their survival, only revealing themselves to those whom they deemed fit (258). In Mean Spirit, the Hill Indians’ dwelling represents a sanctuary uncorrupted by white influence. It is where the Native American Watona inhabitants seek refuge when under physical and/or cultural threat. Historical/cultural trauma scholars Tafoya and Vecchio identify conversion to Christianity as one of the primary sources of trauma that Native Americans faced after their initial contact with the Europeans. They reveal the settlers’ understanding that the Native American population could be better controlled “if they practiced ‘real’ religion and gave up their savage religious customs” (59). However, in Mean Spirit, the hills around Watona represent centers where counter-conversion takes place without any form of coercion. While forced conversion to Christianity had led to trauma, Hogan portrays Christian characters, and indigenous characters assimilated with Euro-American culture, finding inner peace in turning to indigenous values. Among them are Michael Horse, Joe and Martha Billy, Stace Red Hawk, Deputy Willis, and notably, Father Dunne—a Catholic priest, who “discovers” and announces to the Hill Indians that “the snake is our sister” (262). This information, however, is not new to the traditional Native people, who are shown to live in harmony with nature. One of the
most uplifting moments in the novel occurs when the Hill Indians (original and converted) and the Watona Indians establish the efficacy of united action by defending the bats at Sorrow Cave against shooting by the non-Native Watona inhabitants. The incident at Sorrow Cave, towards the end of the book, suggests a model on which the indigenous characters in Mean Spirit can base their future resistance. In her insightful article, “Showdown at Sorrow Cave: Bat Medicine and the Spirit of Resistance in Mean Spirit,” Andrea Musher asserts that the indigenous characters’ success at Sorrow Cave subverts the “automatic privileging of human life over other life forms” in Euro-American tradition (24). In presenting this episode, Hogan undermines “the biblical concept of human dominion,” and supplants it with the Native American worldview, where every living being has a status equal to that of human beings (Musher 24). The “showdown” begins with Belle’s discovery of a group of white Watona dwellers set to attack the bats at Sorrow Cave, mistaking them to be a source of rabies. Of course, the cash award for each “flying rat” killed adds to their interest in massacring the bats (277). Belle immediately sends for reinforcements and places herself at the mouth of the cave, threatening to shoot the bat exterminators. Soon her “reinforcements” arrive—the Watona Indians, the Hill Indians and those converted to Indian values—looming “out of the land itself” (280). Together they form a barricade between the bats and their predators, forcing the trigger-happy white men to momentarily retreat. Musher emphasizes the events after the white men depart, for the bats then direct their defenders to a hidden escape route through the inner wall of the cave. Within the inner caverns of Sorrow, the Native characters come across the mummified remains of a fellow Native human and a vanished bear species, along with several pots, preserved corn kernels, and paintings of red bats, blue fish and black buffalo on the walls (284). During this journey through the passage from the inner wall of Sorrow to the river, a member of the resistance exclaims, “Sorrow runs deeper than we knew or could have guessed” (284). Here, “Sorrow” is a pun indicating both the cave inhabited by the bats, as well as the historical trauma that the indigenous peoples have undergone. The inner chambers of Sorrow represent both a “sacred world” protected within the cave, and a past that must be recalled in order that healing may take place (284). According to Musher, “the saving power evoked in this ritual journey comes from the creation and preservation of a community that ‘re-members’ the past—thus filling the present and future with members who share memories that link them together” (35). Coming to terms with the past is an important element of healing both for scholars analyzing PTSD and historical/cultural trauma, and in Linda Hogan’s artistic vision. Refuting Gaston Bachelard’s characterization of memory as a field of “psychological ruins,” in The Woman Who Watches over the World (2001), Hogan redefines memory as a “field of healing that has the capacity to restore the world” (15). “When a person says ‘I remember,’ all things are possible,” she goes on to proclaim (15). The indigenous characters in Mean Spirit take part in this vital act of remembering, and therefore healing, within the walls of Sorrow Cave.

In addition to the inner strength the Native characters gain from their experience within the recesses of Sorrow Cave, their successful defense of their relatives—the bats—initiates a pattern for future resistance. As the sheriff retreats unable to withstand the Native opposition, one of the bat exterminators protests, “You’re setting a precedent here ... Now they’ll resist
everything” (281). The showdown at Sorrow Cave, where the Native inhabitants of the hills and the town unite to uphold the “ecological unity and the interdependence of all species, and the right to be free from ecological destruction” (Principle one), contains the seeds of a larger movement to be organized around environmental rights.

Hogan elaborates on the theme of resistance and healing in her second novel, Solar Storms. The indigenous characters in Solar Storms organize against a megadam project threatening their community. Besides resisting at the site of injustice as in Mean Spirit, the activists in Solar Storms carry out a lengthy legal battle in non-Native courts of justice situated far from the land they defend. This process is extremely strenuous for the indigenous members since they are maltreated in a system that looks down upon their values. Yet their struggle eventually yields positive results. After causing widespread devastation to the land, with its human and nonhuman inhabitants, further construction of the dams is prevented. The protagonist, Angel, ruminates near the end of the novel—“one fracture was healed, one crack mended, one piece back in place” (344). Such a movement is inconceivable in Mean Spirit because of the dominant society’s complete disregard toward indigenous environmental rights and the indigenous peoples’ unfamiliarity with the Euro-American legal system at the time of the novel’s setting. Therefore, it was not until her second novel, set in the 1970s, that Hogan could present her philosophy of healing in detail. Mean Spirit, however, contains the beginnings of resistance—coming together against the perpetrators of wrong—which, in Hogan’s view, is the first step toward healing from environmental injustice induced trauma.

Works Cited


